



## Accountability in (Integrated) Health Service Delivery in The Netherlands: A scoping review

---

Dennis R. van Kerkvoorden



Dennis.vankerkvoorden@hu.nl

#EHMA2020

# Dennis R. van Kerkvoorden MSc

- Nurse, Nurse-trainer/lecturer, Nurse Manager (all types of departments in hospitals), Lean six sigma projects in hospitals, Hospital information management.
- Education:
  - Nurse education, Nurse trainers education (Inholland University of Applied Sciences)
  - Nurse Management training (Leiden University of Applied Sciences, NCOI University).
  - Healthcare Management (Erasmus School of Health Policy and Management Rotterdam).
  - Master in Public Administration: public sector management/Administration of Healthcare Systems (Leiden University).
  - Post-Master: Leadership for Complex Change in healthcare and welfare (Utrecht University of applied sciences).
- Present:
  - Senior Lecturer and Researcher, Master of Science Integrated Care Design & Research-group Personalized Integrated Care (Utrecht University of applied Sciences).
  - PhD Candidate/student Innovation and Governance of Integrated Care (Prof. Mirella Minkman PhD, distinguished professor TIAS School for Business and Society & CEO Vilans Centre of Expertise for Long-term Care in the Netherlands).

#EHMA2020

# Dennis R. van Kerkvoorden MSc

- Subjects:
  - Accountability, Performance Measurement and Governance in (integrated) healthcare.
  - Quality of Care.
  - Learning ability of organizations in relation with performance measurement.
  - Bureaucracy in the public sector.
  - Information management in the public sector.

# Introduction

- Accountability has a multiform character.
- Accountability in Dutch healthcare much debate:
  - Blijk van vertrouwen, anders verantwoorden.
  - Vote of confidence, justify otherwise.
    - Council of Public Health & Society (RVS), 2019

# Introduction

- RVS (2019) state:
  - Accountability in four perspectives:
    - Private
    - Public
    - Professional
    - Societal

# Introduction

- RVS (2019) also state:
  - Accountability in five functions:
    - Collection of data for policy development.
    - Compliance to ruling, laws and norms.
    - Opportunity to be accountable and to gather support.
    - Strengthening of own position.
    - Learning and improving.



# Focus

- Movement from single organization healthservice delivery towards integrated healthservice delivery.
- Accountability from viewpoint of single organization is comprehensive and complicated.
- Accountability in integrated health service delivery is also comprehensive and complicated.
- What are starting points or principles of accountability in integrated health service delivery? (Overall research topic)
- First: What is accountability in Dutch healthcare in the current era?

# Scoping Review

Research question:

What is the state of play of accountability of knowledge and practice in healthcare in The Netherlands, according to the literature?

Methods:

Five stages were followed: (1) identifying the research question, (2) composing the search string and validating the search string, (3) database search, (4) assess the data, (5) collating en reporting on the results.

Following Prisma Guidelines of Scoping Review

Databases:

Databases: Academic Search Complete, Business Source Premier, CINAHL, PubMed and Wiley Online Library were searched from 2009 to 2019.

#EHMA2020

# Scoping Review

Synthesis of results:

- 1) Fields or domains of state of play of accountability.
  - 2) Accountability from who to who.
- 3) Terms, definitions and descriptions of accountability.
  - 4) Issues reported on accountability.
- 5) Why, What and How accountability is applied.

# Scoping Review

## Results:

- 404 articles.
- 325 articles after removing duplicates.
- 58 articles included and 267 excluded (title/abstract).
- 15 articles after full text inquiry excluded.
- 43 article included in this study.

## Inclusion:

Knowlegde and practice

## Exclusion:

Descriptions of a healthcare program, clinical skills, single disease, quality of care, policy, medication, treatment, record systems, insurance, legal and non-Dutch context.

#EHMA2020

# Scoping Review

## Results:

1. Fields/Domains: hospital care (36%) and healthcare providers in general (25%)
2. Who to who:
  - Hospitals to a wide range of stakeholders (27%)
  - Healthcare & Youth Inspectorate (IGJ) to a wide range of stakeholders (15%)
  - Informal caregivers, patient-organizations cited once.
3. Terms of accountability:
  - Quality (31%)
  - Performance (16%)
  - Responsibility (16%)
  - Improvement (11%)

# Scoping Review

## Results:

### 4. Issues of accountability:

Accountability by measurement

Different views of different actors

Perverse effects of accountability

Tension between internal and external accountability

### 5. Why, What and How of accountability:

Why: Assessment, comparison, quality, learning and innovation

What: 'to plant oneself accountable', regulating, commitment, costs and governmental ruling.

How: indicators, supervision, measuring and monitoring, mystery guests, Visitation, self-regulation or self-responsibility.

#EHMA2020

# Scoping Review

Discussion:

Domains/Sectors:

- Much attention to hospital care and Health and Youth inspectorate.
- System of regulated market forces and position of insurers/Dutch healthcare reforms since 2007 And the quest of ways to account for to Health and Youth inspectorate and the behavior of inspectorate itself.

Who to Who:

- Change to market orientation and the growing attention of quality of care in mainly hospital care.
- Health & Youth inspectorate: Looking for ways of accountability in close cooperation of all involved parties.

#EHMA2020



# Scoping Review

## Discussion



### Terms/definitions:

- Most used terms: Quality, Performance, Improving.
- Less used terms: Transparency, Supervision, Compliance.
- Lack of clarity.

### Issues:

- Perverse effects and the danger of unintended side effects of accountability, such as misinterpretation, tunnelvision, gaming.

### Why What en how:

- Underlying mechanism can be of importance for understanding the relationship between accountability and performance.
- Essence of accountability.

#EHMA2020

# Scoping Review

What are consequences for accountability in integrated health service delivery?

- All previous points apply also for accountability in integrated health service delivery.
- Integration of health care is not only merging organizations and budget and seeking a one size system of governance and accountability. It is also about accounting for what happens on a service level and clinical level.
- Bundle payment and the consequence of integrating different services to one new service and how accountability must be performed.

# Scoping Review

## Limitations:

- Financial accountability
  - Debate about accountability and accounting, however Sc.Rev. Brought clarity and provided an overview
  - The entirety of term accountability in searchrule.

# Scoping Review

Conclusion:

- Insight in the state of play of knowledge and practice of accountability in healthcare in The Netherlands, according to the literature.
- New leads to explore to develop principles of accountability in integrated healthservice delivery.